

## **HIRING TOOLKIT**

Use this toolkit as a starting point to mitigate gender, racial, and other hidden biases in your institutional recruiting and hiring processes. This toolkit does not address how to mitigate individual biases or have challenging conversations. It does give you some tips on structural pieces you can implement to recruit, retain, and promote a broader range of talented people.

### **The Big Picture**

- Identify the criteria for a successful search:** Institute recruitment targets for hiring across identities. For example, after the National Football League mandated that any team with a head coaching vacancy must interview at least one person of color before making a hire, candidates of color were 19% to 21% more likely to fill a head coaching vacancy.<sup>1</sup>
- Institute accountability:** Create institutional processes that hold managers accountable for fair and inclusive hiring practices.
- Recruit intentionally and often:** Post the call for applications on a variety of job sites. (see Appendix for suggestions).
- Hire in clusters:** Research shows that cluster hiring—hiring multiple employees into one or more departments based on shared interests and identities—increases both the diversity of the incoming talent pool as well as retention of female staff and staff of color.<sup>2</sup> So when you're thinking about hiring one person of color, ask yourself “why one when I can hire three?”

### **Marketing**<sup>3</sup>

- Do prospective candidates see themselves reflected in your materials, such as your website and printed marketing materials?** Aspirational advertising is not misrepresentational as long as your materials authentically represent who you reasonably aspire to be, and you are putting money where your mouth is to expand recruiting efforts and cultivate an inclusive culture.
- Do your materials represent other identities that your candidates may have, including age, sexual orientation, gender expression, and disability?** Women and people of color walk through the world at an intersection of multiple

---

<sup>1</sup> Maya A. Beasley, *Diversity Derailed: Limited Demand, Effort, and Results in Environmental C-Suite Searches*, (October 2016), available online at <http://www.diversegreen.org/diversity-derailed/>.

<sup>2</sup> Colleen Flaherty, *Cluster Hiring and Diversity*, Inside Hiring Ed (May 1, 2015), available online at <http://bit.ly/1FC8blZ>

<sup>3</sup> Some of these tips are adaptive, and not technical, meaning that they require introspection and deep work of culture change. Merely diversifying your image will be ineffective without adaptive work. For assistance on how you can complement these technical fixes with adaptive work, contact us for a consultation.

identities, some more salient than others. Not essentializing people by a single identity is key to creating a visually inclusive marketing message.

- **Do the activities portrayed in your materials speak to all audiences?** Often conservation and outdoor organizations' optics feature individuals engaging in very singular activities such as hiking, backpacking, kayaking, and rock climbing, and don't speak to every person's relationship with outdoor recreation. Try to include imagery of groups of people (not just individuals) engaging in a broad range of activities, including fishing, picnics, walking, etc.
- **Do candidates know that your value diversity, inclusion, and equity?** Make sure you have a diversity, equity, and inclusion statement that declares your organization's commitment and values, and that this statement not only is in every job posting but is featured prominently on your website or jobs landing page.

### **Job Descriptions** (see Appendix for an example)

- **Only the bare necessities:** Job descriptions should be succinct. Potential applicants can be dissuaded from applying if they feel they do not meet all qualifications. For example, one study shows men apply for jobs when they can check off 6 out of 10 boxes on the list of qualifications; women only apply when they can check off all 10.<sup>4</sup> Take out anything that is not required of the candidate. In particular:
  - Do not require English language skills (which can be illegal unless necessary to the safe performance of a job).
  - Ditch all "preferred" qualifications, including specific degrees, prior outdoor or nonprofit experience, or that the candidate be a prior participant in your program. These can be raised in the interview.
- **Include less of the teachable skills and more non-teachable skills.** Organizations often overvalue skills and qualifications that are teachable (e.g., familiarity with a specific environmental law or experience backpacking) and undervalue skills that are less teachable (e.g., ability to work well on a team, ability to accept feedback graciously and integrate it, communication skills). In fact, those skills that are typically labeled "soft" are in fact some of the most technical skills a person will need to learn.
- **Cast a wider net with "fair and balanced" wording:** Job descriptions language should be balanced language to make your organization attractive to everybody. Certain wording may signal to someone that they may not fit or belong in that job. For example, a study of 4,000 job descriptions found that that postings for jobs dominated by men had a high frequency of words such as *lead*, *head*, *direct*, *determined*, and *superior*, and postings for jobs dominated by women had a balance of these words and complementary words such as *collaborate*, *committed*, *responsive*, and *self-aware*.<sup>5</sup> The chart in the appendix provides examples of these words. Researchers also found women were more interested in jobs when the description had a balance of words (even when the job was male-dominated, like engineering).

---

<sup>4</sup> Tara Sophia Mohr, *Why Women Don't Apply for Jobs Unless They're 100% Qualified*, (Harvard Business Review Aug. 25, 2014).

<sup>5</sup> Danielle Gaucher, Justin Friesen, & Aaron Kay, *Evidence that Gendered Wording in Job Advertisements Exists and Sustains Gender Inequality*, *Journal of Personality and Social Psychology*, Vol. 101, No. 1, pp. 109-128 (2011).

- ❑ **The criteria should allow candidates to demonstrate important life experiences that may not show up on traditional résumés:** Job descriptions should encourage applicants to describe any pertinent experience, including professional and personal experience.
- ❑ **Describe skills desired, not characteristics:** For example, the ability to take initiative and produce results is a skill, but “action-oriented, results-driven” describes character.
- ❑ **Separate required and desired skills:** And mean it. Conflating required and desired skills can deter some people from even applying, especially women. Being clear about required and desired skills will also help you create a clearer rubric for selecting candidates for interviews.
- ❑ **Don’t require candidates to be available evenings and weekends unless absolutely necessary:** Adding this to your job description may needlessly eliminate qualified candidates who are caregivers of others or may have other life priorities.
- ❑ **Include criteria such as “ability to effectively work on diverse teams or with a diverse range of people”** If this is a position that is directly linked to carrying out diversity & inclusion efforts, be specific about the qualifications they need to carry out the specific work.
- ❑ **Disclose salary range:** Allow candidates to decide whether the salary range is fiscally feasible or desirable for them before they put the work into submitting an application
- ❑ **Add “salary negotiable:”** This two-word phrase has been proven to decrease the pay gap and mitigate biases against women and those from more collectivistic cultures that may not value assertive self-advocacy. For example, researchers posted two versions of job announcements in stereotypically masculine businesses (NASCAR, football, and basketball), with one version including the words “salary negotiable.” They found that women were less likely to negotiate their salaries without these words, and that ultimately this two-word phrase closed the negotiation gap and the pay gap between the male and female hires by 45%.<sup>6</sup>
- ❑ **Don’t ask for salary history:** Unless you can articulate how salary history will help the hiring committee select a candidate, don’t ask for salary history. A person’s past salary has no bearing on their experience and expertise. In fact, asking salary history is legally prohibited in Massachusetts as of 2016.
- ❑ **Be honest about your preference for an internal candidate:** Often companies express the desire to cast a wide net, but have a clear preference for an internal candidate. Be clear to all candidates whether you prefer someone who has had experience within your organization or company.
- ❑ **Be transparent about your process, including hiring timeline and start date:** Tell your candidates about your timeline and then stick to it. Often candidates are applying for multiple jobs and are juggling schedules and deserve to know your timeline. Plus, putting a clear timeline in your job posting saves you the time of having to answer the same timeline questions over and over again.

---

<sup>6</sup> Andreas Leibbrandt, John A. List, *Do Women Avoid Salary Negotiations? Evidence from a Large Scale Natural Field Experiment*, National Bureau of Economic Research Working Paper No. 18511 (Issued Nov. 2012).

- **Don't ask applicants to perform time-consuming projects as part of their application, and if you do, compensate them for their time:** It's ok to ask candidates who have advanced in the process to provide some materials, but it should not be excessive (i.e. take longer than 3 hours). If you would like candidates to provide something more robust, consider compensating them for their time.

### **Your Team**

- **Form a recruiting committee:** Ensuring more than one person makes hiring decisions creates a system of checks and balances that mitigates each individual's biases and results in greater success in hiring the right candidates.
- **Ensure your team is diverse:** A diverse hiring team further mitigates individual team members' biases and counterbalances inherent institutional biases that disadvantage women, people of color, and other underrepresented communities. Diversity includes hierarchy, location, gender, age, sexual orientation, race, and ethnicity, among other traits.

### **Screening résumés**

- **Screen résumés sans names, address, and even school—just look at experience:** Fold the résumé over or take a sharpie to the name, address, and education section for the first round of review to mitigate bias.
  - In a study of identical résumés —one with a man's name and one with a woman's— researchers found that 79% of male applicants vs. only 49% of female applicants name were deemed 'worthy of hire' and that the women deemed worthy of hire received \$4,000 less in compensation.<sup>7</sup>
  - In another study, résumés with white-sounding names received 50% more calls for interviews than identical résumés with black-sounding names, and researches concluded the white-sounding name was equivalent to about 8 more years of experience.<sup>8</sup>
- **Check your maternal bias:** Membership in a PTA or taking time off to be a stay-at-home mother should not count against the candidate. In a study of identical résumés with one difference—"membership in the PTA"— researchers found that those listing this were 79% less likely to be hired, half as likely to be promoted, and offered an average of \$11,000 less in salary.<sup>9</sup>
- **Check your style bias:** If you want top talent, you need to recognize different résumés' communication styles and the skill sets behind them. If you dismiss a candidate based on their résumé, be clear about what skills and experience the candidate lacks. For example, in an analysis of 1,100 résumés in the tech sector (which like the outdoor industry is traditionally dominated by men and masculine culture), researchers found that the women's

---

<sup>7</sup> Corinne A. Moss-Racusin, et. al., *Science faculty's subtle gender biases favor male students*, Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the U.S.A., Vol. 109, No. 41 (Oct. 9, 2012).

<sup>8</sup> Bertrand, M. & Mullainathan, S. (2004). *Are Emily and Greg more employable than Lakisha and Jamal? A field experiment on labor market discrimination*. The American Economic Review, 94(4), 991.

<sup>9</sup> Correll, S.J., Benard, S., & Paik, I. (2007). *Getting a job: is there a motherhood penalty?* American Journal of Sociology 112(5), 1297.

résumés were longer than the mens', but that they included less precise bullet-by-bullet job descriptions than the mens' and instead had more high-level job descriptions with narratives interweaving their experience.<sup>10</sup> The women told stories; the men let the facts speak for themselves. Though both qualities are valuable, the tech industry is far more equipped to appreciate precise execution, which results in a résumé reading bias that overwhelmingly eliminates qualified female candidates.

## **The Interview**

- **Interview each person in the same space or via the same technology:** Each person being interviewed should be interviewed via the same medium. If a candidate is unable interview in person and is interviewed over video, then all other candidates should be interviewed over video.
- **Ensure your physical space is clean, bright, and not decorated like a “man cave.”** The power of subtle social signals is incredible. Even the way your physical space is designed can send signals of inclusion or exclusion. In a Stanford University study of undeclared majors, researchers found women were more likely to consider degrees in engineering and computer science when the room in which they were interviewed was clean and decorated in a gender neutral fashion (so, no Cheetos, beer cans, and circuit boards).<sup>11</sup> You too can pay homage to your organization's gritty culture and humble roots without a physical space that turns people off. This includes making sure the interviewee has access to a clean and well-stocked bathroom, decorating with neutral images or, if you have images of people, including a balance of people of multiple identities. Also remember that the impact of décor continues past the interview—to make your workplace truly inclusive you don't want your interview room to be the only welcoming space in your workplace.
- **Introduce the candidate to employees who may identify the way they do:** For example, ensure women candidates meet other women and people of color meet other people of color.
- **Use an interviewing rubric:** An interview rubric ensures that each candidate is asked the same questions and that their answers will be evaluated similarly. The rubric helps guide the interview so casual conversation and affinity bias are mitigated. It also allows the hiring committee to similarly assess each candidate to make a fair decision. This is probably the most challenging piece of mitigating hiring bias. Rubrics can feel robotic, contrived, and not conversational . . . which is exactly why they are necessary. Casual conversation is rife with opportunities for affinity bias, where interviewers latch on to commonalities between themselves and the candidate that may have nothing to do with the job but make the interviewer feel like the candidate would be a “great fit.” Maybe they went to the same school as you. Or maybe they're from the same town. A rubric ensures that you ask only those questions that are necessary, and that you have predetermined what constitutes a good, mediocre, and bad response to each question. Want to know what a rubric looks like? Google it.

---

<sup>10</sup> Kieran Snyder, *The resume gap: Are different gender styles contributing to tech's dismal diversity?* (Fortune March 26, 2015).

<sup>11</sup> Google Ventures, *Unconscious Bias @ Work* (Sep. 24, 2014).

- **Check your body language and your expectations for the candidates'**  
**body language:** Expecting candidates to shake your hand firmly, make eye contact, sit squarely to you, and speak in a loud, modulated, firm tone biases your interview in favor of white, American, male candidates. In many communities of color, eye contact is seen as an affront, sitting squarely is viewed as aggressive and not respectful, and handshakes are not a common practice.
- **Embrace multiple communication styles:** If you want to recruit a wider range of people, you need to embrace a wider range of communication styles than the dominant, which is direct, informal, and immediate. Depending on the candidate's culture, they may be more indirect or even use storytelling to make a point, they may be more formal than you're used to, and they may be more reflective. Provide the candidate with time to respond and ask clarifying questions if you do not understand their response.
- **Consider sharing interview questions prior to the interview:** Some candidates' strength is in their ability to deliberate and process complex issues. By asking complex questions in the interview, you may not be giving more reflective candidates a chance to demonstrate their ability to process complex information. If you're worried that a candidate will go research and seek answers to the question from other people or resources, don't be. That's a sign of a person who knows where to find information, synthesize it, and apply it to your organization. That's a great skill!
- **Ask if there is anything you didn't ask that the candidate wants to contribute:** Your application and interview process may have not given the candidate a space to talk about something they really want to share. Give them that opportunity at the end of the interview.
- **Offer to give feedback to all candidates about their interview:** In your email or phone call, be sure to make it clear that you are happy to give feedback to them about their application process.

### **The Selection:**

- **Consider the long term:** Often interview committees focus on what needs to happen in the short term, and think about how candidates can achieve those goals. That can shift a committee's preference toward an internal candidate. If the position has high turnover, then thinking about the short term is certainly important. However, it is also important to think about how that candidate can contribute to new ideas for larger scale projects.
- **Don't have "automatic eliminators:"** Eliminating candidates because of a typo in their application or the wrong kind of education does not serve anyone.

## APPENDIX

Where to post jobs: Examples of social media and job sites built to attract specific demographics are the Forté Foundation job board, diversityjobs.com, diversity.com, hirediversity.com, womenforhire.com, oiwc.org, Indeed.com, Idealist.org, Malakye.com, Glassdoor.com, Outdoorindustryjobs.com, university outdoor clubs, Diversity networking forums on LinkedIn and Identity specific social networks such as the Environmental Professionals of Color Facebook page, Association of Latino Professionals of America, Hispanic Access Foundation, grassroots outdoor groups (Black Girls Ride, Outdoor Afro, Latino Outdoors, GirlTrek, Vive Northwest), career fairs at diverse colleges and universities (Historically Black Colleges and Universities and Hispanic Serving Institutions), and bloggers from nontraditional demographics (mom bloggers, bloggers of color such as Glenn Nelson of the High Country News)

Footnote 3 elaboration: Danielle Gaucher, Justin Friesen, & Aaron Kay, *Evidence that Gendered Wording in Job Advertisements Exists and Sustains Gender Inequality*, Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, Vol. 101, No. 1, pp. 109-128 (2011). The chart below provides some examples words that, when use din balance, can mitigate bias in job descriptions.

<b>“MASCULINE” WORDS</b>	<b>“FEMININE” WORDS</b>
Lead	Join
Head	Dedicated
Determined	Committed
Driven	Motivated
Ambitious	Inspired
Superior participant	Responsive,
experiences	Sympathetic
Competitive	Sensitive to participants’ needs
Assertive	Collaborative
Decisive	Cooperative
Outspoken	Honest
Assertive	Understanding
Independent	Engaged
Direct	Loyal
Assist	Support
Analyze	Review
Determine	Establish
Individualized	Community
Risk	Connected
Gamble	Interpersonal
Master	Experience
Acquire knowledge	Understand
Aptitude	Learn
Self-confident	Ability
Intellect	Self-aware
Challenge	Acumen
	Opportunity

Example of changes you can make to a job description to mitigate bias and cast a wider net

Original Job Description	Better Job Description
<p align="center"><b><u>PROGRAM COORDINATOR – XYZ OUTDOOR PROGRAM</u></b></p> <p><b>Description</b> Responsible for creating a world-class outdoor experience for participants and is a professional role model in attitude and appearance. Assists the Program Director in curriculum, briefing, debriefing, and evaluation, and completes all assignments delegated by the Program Director.</p> <p><b>General Responsibilities:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Direct instructor teams to achieve stated student outcomes;</li> <li>• Provides superior support with individualized attention to each instructor;</li> <li>• Acquire knowledge of curriculum, learning objectives, and student outcomes;</li> <li>• Complete additional assignments from Program Director, including but not limited to:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Managing curriculum library (virtual and had copy)</li> <li>b. Briefing and debriefing instructor tams</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>Required Qualifications:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Curriculum design experience;</li> <li>• Experience in facilitation (briefing, debriefing);</li> <li>• College degree;</li> <li>• Excellent skills in developing lesson plans;</li> <li>• Results and task-oriented style;</li> <li>• Flexibility in personal time commitments to do what is necessary based on the needs of the organization;</li> <li>• Up-to-date computer skills with the aptitude to learn and utilize XYZ’s database system and other programs;</li> </ul> <p><b>Preferred Qualifications:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Outdoor program experience;</li> <li>• Graduate of XYZ Outdoor Program;</li> <li>• College degree.</li> <li>•</li> </ul> <p><b>Salary: \$30,000</b></p> <p><b>Submit résumé and cover letter to <a href="mailto:programs@xyzoutdoors.org">programs@xyzoutdoors.org</a>.</b></p>	<p align="center"><b><u>PROGRAM COORDINATOR – XYZ OUTDOOR PROGRAM</u></b></p> <p><b>Description</b> Part of a collaborative team responsible for working together to meet program objectives, including setting instructors up to provide students with positive outcomes and a welcoming experience.</p> <p><b>General Responsibilities:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Supporting instructor teams to and they gel and work well together;</li> <li>• Responsive and sympathetic to instructors’ needs to set them up for success;</li> <li>• Dedicated to learning about our curriculum, learning objectives and student outcomes;</li> <li>• Support the Program Director with other tasks, including but not limited to:             <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>a. Managing curriculum library (virtual and had copy)</li> <li>b. Briefing and debriefing instructor tams</li> </ul> </li> </ul> <p><b>Required Qualifications:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Curriculum design experience;</li> <li>• Experience in facilitation (briefing, debriefing);</li> <li>• Exceptional interpersonal skills;</li> <li>• Ability to work on diverse teams or with a diverse range of people;</li> <li>• Ability to take initiative and produce results;</li> <li>• Dedicated and committed to the mission of XYZ Outdoor Program;</li> <li>• Up-to-date computer skills and an understanding of how to learn and utilize XYZ’s database system and other programs;</li> </ul> <p><b>Salary: Base starts at \$30,000 but is negotiable</b></p> <p><b>Submit résumé and cover letter to <a href="mailto:programs@xyzoutdoors.org">programs@xyzoutdoors.org</a>, and make sure to address any pertinent experience, including professional and personal experience, that is relevant to this position.</b></p> <p><b>Timeline:</b> Deadline is May 2, 2016; Screening will happen May 3-4, 2016. Calls for interviews will occur by May 5, 2016. Interviews will be scheduled for the week of May 9, 2016. A final decision will be made by Monday, May 16, 2016.</p>